FRAUD'S IMPACT ON HEALTHCARE DURING COVID-19

Global survey on fraud and corruption affecting healthcare systems during COVID-19 in April 2020
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This survey finds that COVID-19 related fraud substantially reduced healthcare delivery in April 2020.

We received answers from 512 respondents, 92% of whom were anti-fraud professionals. They wrote about 58 countries representing 76% of the global population.

Fraud involving personal protective equipment (PPE) was by far the most wide-spread issue. It was reported from 81% of countries surveyed. A relevant black market was reported from 62% of countries surveyed, healthcare funds embezzlement from 58%, cyber attacks on healthcare from 46%, medical bribes from 22%.

These issues led to strikes of medical personnel and the emergence of whistleblowers in every second country. Respondents linked fraud and corruption to suspected deaths in every third country.

This survey found that early warning whistleblowers were suppressed in every fourth country. This is the single most important fraud-related factor aiding the spread of COVID-19. The fact that early detection is of paramount importance was amply demonstrated by other studies (1) and the success of countries prioritizing this aspect during the current pandemic (e.g. South Korea).

Fraud and corruption led to deaths in every third country surveyed, to strikes of medical personnel and whistleblowers in every second.

80% of respondents think that fraud and corruption's impact on their country's healthcare system was "very important" (59%) or "important" (21%).

We conclude that an aggressive anti-fraud strategy must become an integral part of fighting COVID-19 and any similar event.

As a former criminal investigator and Certified Fraud Examiner specializing in healthcare fraud, waste and abuse, I believe the highest priority should be placed on the prevention, detection, investigation and prosecution of healthcare fraud.

Survey respondent, USA
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE OF CONTENTS</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Executive Summary</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objectives</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methodology</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Findings</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Core Issues</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consequences</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevance</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix I: Detailed Findings</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix II: Questionnaire</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contact</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
OBJECTIVES

Healthcare systems worldwide are currently fighting on two fronts. One is COVID-19. The other is fraud.

Fraud always reduces the response capacities of healthcare systems. During a pandemic, this leads to deaths and prolongs national shutdowns.

This survey estimates the impact and relevance of fraud and corruption on healthcare capacities, while fighting COVID-19 in April 2020.

It does so by analyzing the spread of 7 core issues and their 3 consequences. It concludes by asking for an assessment of the impact of fraud on the national healthcare system.

An assessment of fraud and corruption affecting healthcare requires specialized knowledge. This survey was therefore aimed at anti-fraud professionals.

The survey’s results are intended to support anti-fraud professionals in their efforts and to provide governments and healthcare executives with a current and global overview.

Fighting both fraud and a pandemic have one thing in common: Responses must be swift and decisive.

This survey does not and cannot claim to give a complete global picture, nor does it attempt to compare countries.

The goal of this survey is to estimate the impact of fraud and corruption on healthcare capabilities in April 2020, during COVID-19. We focused on seven core issues:

1.) fraud involving PPE,
2.) fraud involving ventilators,
3.) existence of a black markets,
4.) existence of faulty equipment,
5.) cyber attacks on healthcare,
6.) healthcare embezzlement,
7.) medical bribes.

We looked at three consequences:

1.) strikes,
2.) deaths,
3.) appearance of whistleblowers.

We asked for the estimated impact of the above and concluded with an open question.
METHODOLOGY AND DEFINITIONS

NEMEXIS designed this survey as a descriptive research project. It was fielded from April 4 - April 22, 2020 by the NEMEXIS team. Sample size n=512. The survey questionnaire is part of this presentation.

Data was collected by sending participation requests online to people who identify themselves on their LinkedIn profile to be anti-fraud professionals. All had a prior connection to a NEMEXIS associate or partner.

Survey results are anonymous.

Respondents did not receive payment. They were informed that they would receive the results of this survey.

We use the term "fraud" according to the definition of the ACFE (Association of Certified Fraud Examiners). Fraud "includes any intentional or deliberate act to deprive another of property or money by guile, deception, or other unfair means."

The global regions used in this survey are identical to those used by the ACFE in its "Report to the Nations". This will allow readers to also use the Report's regional benchmark data on healthcare.

We are aware that fraud and corruption are characterized by high numbers of unreported cases. We are also aware that this survey describes a very early stage of the COVID-19 fraud cycle.

"The survey was fielded from April 4-22, 2020.

Given these two arguments and despite aiming the survey at anti-fraud specialists who have access to unpublished material, we decided to err on the side of caution when presenting results. Thus, we took a descriptive approach and present only answers (data points) affirming the existence of an issue.

The survey analysis has to be regarded as the most conservative estimate of COVID-19 fraud affecting healthcare in April 2020.
Corruption is the biggest threat in dealing with the resources gathered to fight COVID-19. We need anti-fraud controls to ensure they are not diverted for personal gain.

Survey respondent, Namibia
KEY FINDINGS: GLOBAL OVERVIEW

- anti fraud-professionals 92%
- based their statement on the media* 75%
- based their statement on personal experience* 57%
- based their statement on other sources* 30%
* statements can be based on multiple sources

Respondents 512

Country covered in this survey
Country not covered in this survey

Surveyed countries 58
- surveyed countries, population total (mio.) 5.748
- as ratio of global population total (%) 76%

Other 244
- number of answers received via open-ended question 244
- ratio of answers received via open-ended question 47%
KEY FINDINGS: REGIONAL DISTRIBUTION

- **United States and Canada**
  - 140 respondents (27.3%)
  - 2 countries covered (3.5%)

- **Southern Asia**
  - 96 respondents (19%)
  - 4 countries covered (7%)

- **Sub-Saharan Africa**
  - 84 respondents (16.4%)
  - 13 countries covered (22.4%)

- **Middle East and North Africa**
  - 45 respondents (8.8%)
  - 6 countries covered (10.3%)

- **Western Europe**
  - 68 respondents (13.3%)
  - 10 countries covered (17%)

- **Asia-Pacific**
  - 33 respondents (6.5%)
  - 6 countries covered (10.3%)

- **Central & Eastern Europe, Central Asia**
  - 26 respondents (5%)
  - 8 countries covered (13.8%)

- **Latin America and the Caribbean**
  - 20 respondents (4%)
  - 9 countries covered (15.5%)
KEY FINDINGS: CORE ISSUES

We analyzed seven core issues: fraud involving PPE or ventilators, the existence of a relevant black market and faulty equipment, healthcare embezzlement, cyber-attacks on healthcare and medical bribes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Ratio of Countries Surveyed</th>
<th>Ratio of Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PPE</td>
<td>81%</td>
<td>55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black market</td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faulty equipment</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cyber attack</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Embezzlement</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ventilators</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bribes</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
"Personal protective equipment" (PPE) includes face masks, face shields or goggles, non-sterile gloves and an isolation gown. Was personal protective equipment stolen, bought or sold at unusually high prices or bought and never delivered?
KEY FINDINGS: BLACK MARKET

Question
Are you aware of a black market for test kits, personal protective equipment or ventilators in your country?

Yes
No OR I do not know
Country was not covered in this survey
KEY FINDINGS: FAULTY EQUIPMENT

Question

Are you aware of faulty test kits, personal protective equipment and ventilators in your country?
Are you aware of cyber attacks on the healthcare system in your country during the current pandemic (CEO-fraud, DDOS, malware, etc.)?
KEY FINDINGS: EMBEZZLEMENT

Question
Are you aware of financial support from government and/or private entities from your country and/or abroad being embezzled by government entities, health care officials, hospital management, doctors or nurses?

- Yes
- No OR I do not know
- Country was not covered in this survey
"Ventilators" include a machine and its supply of oxygen. Are you aware of ventilators being stolen, bought or sold at unusually high prices or bought and never delivered?
Are you aware of doctors or nurses asking for bribes in order to test, admit, treat or care for patients with Covid-19 symptoms?
It was our assumption that the seven core problems would result in the following: The emergence of whistleblowers, strikes and death.

**DEATHS: 33%**
9% of respondents mentioned that core issues are deemed to have led to deaths in every third country surveyed (33%).

**STRIKES: 48%**
23% of respondents mentioned that core issues forced nurses and doctors to refuse to go to work in every second surveyed country (48%).

While whistleblower retaliation was reported from almost every second country surveyed (46%), the problems to which whistleblowers pointed were diverse.
Did any of the cases above (whistleblower suppression; possible fraud involving test kits, personal protective equipment, ventilators; embezzlement of financial support) lead to physicians and/or nurses refusing to go to work in your country?
Did any of the cases above (whistleblower suppression; possible fraud involving test kits, personal protective equipment, ventilators; embezzlement of financial support) lead to suspected deaths?
KEY FINDINGS: WHISTLEBLOWERS (ALL ISSUES)

Question
Did any entity (government, corporation, hospital, etc.) suppress healthcare related whistleblowers in your country during the current pandemic?
Please describe why healthcare related whistleblowers were suppressed during the current pandemic in your country. You can check more than one option. OPTION 1: Whistleblower reporting the infection in its very early stage suffered repressions.
KEY FINDINGS: WHISTLEBLOWERS (EQUIPMENT)

Question

Please describe why healthcare related whistleblowers were suppressed during the current pandemic in your country. You can check more than one option.

OPTION 2: Whistleblower reporting missing equipment (personal protective equipment, ventilators, etc.) suffered repressions.

- Yes
- No OR I do not know
- Country was not covered in this survey
Please describe why healthcare related whistleblowers were suppressed during the current pandemic in your country. You can check more than one option.

OPTION 3: Whistleblower reporting financial embezzlement suffered repressions.
Please describe why healthcare related whistleblowers were suppressed during the current pandemic in your country. You can check more than one option.

OPTION 4: Whistleblower reporting something else but directly related to the corona pandemic suffered repressions.
Finally, we asked how relevant the impact of the aforementioned issues were on healthcare systems fighting corona in the respective country.

**KEY FINDINGS: RELEVANCE**

FRAUD'S IMPACT ON HEALTHCARE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Importance</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Very important</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Important</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somewhat important</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Largely unimportant</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Completeley unimportant</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

We asked respondents how important they think the impact of the core problems mentioned before was on effectively fighting corona in their country.
"Health care professionals refused to work at retirement homes where elderly were mistreated, not properly separated from COVID-19 residents. Many deaths."

Survey respondent, Canada
This survey has found that fraud and corruption seriously reduced healthcare capabilities. Failure to deliver adequate healthcare is the justification for lockdown measures with significant economic and political consequences.

We therefore recommend:

**Our main recommendation** is that an aggressive anti-fraud strategy must become an integral part of fighting COVID-19, currently and in any of its future waves. Fraud prevention, detection, investigation and prosecution will increase healthcare delivery at a fraction of the current costs of lives, time and funds lost.

1.) **Maintain and share anti-fraud capabilities:** Healthcare should maintain and share rapid-response, multi-disciplinary anti-fraud capabilities for the prevention, detection and investigation of fraud and corruption.

2.) **Whistleblowers:** As the suppression of early warning whistleblowers was the single most important fraud-related factor aiding the spread of COVID-19, it is essential that this issue be addressed. All countries must protect their whistleblowers.

   Supra-national, medical, anonymous, two-way whistleblower channels have to be introduced, even against the host country’s wish.

3.) **International cooperation:** Organised crime and COVID-19 are international problems. Effective solutions have to be international whenever feasible. Anti-fraud professionals from 58 countries made this report far more useful than if reports had been prepared separately in each of the countries.
Counterfeit healthcare products are extremely dangerous for any country

Survey respondent, India
UNITED STATES & CANADA: CORE ISSUES

- **PPE**: (stolen, bought but not delivered, purchased or sold at unusually high price)
- **Black market**: (existence of)
- **Faulty equipment**: (existence of)
- **Cyber-attacks**: (on healthcare systems)
- **Embezzlement**: (of healthcare funds)
- **Ventilators**: (stolen, bought but not delivered, purchased or sold at unusually high price)
- **Bribes**: (demanded by medical personnel)

Country was covered in this survey, issue reported
Country was covered in this survey, issue not reported
Country was not covered in this survey
UNITED STATES & CANADA: CONSEQUENCES

Strike
-medical personnel refused to go to work due to core issues

Deaths
-existence of, due to core issues

Whistleblower
-whistleblower suffered retaliation

Whistleblower: early warning
-whistleblower who reported virus early suffered retaliation

Whistleblower: equipment
-whistleblower who reported missing PPE or ventilator suffered retaliation

Whistleblower: embezzlement
-whistleblower who reported embezzlement suffered retaliation

Whistleblower: other
-whistleblower suffered retaliation for reporting something related to COVID-19, but unrelated to early warning, equipment, embezzlement

Country was covered in this survey, issue reported

Country was covered in this survey, issue not reported

Country was not covered in this survey
# UNITED STATES & CANADA: DETAILED FINDINGS

Core issues reported in this region:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>PPE</th>
<th>Black market</th>
<th>Faulty equipment</th>
<th>Cyber-attack</th>
<th>Embezzlement</th>
<th>Ventilators</th>
<th>Bribes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>US</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**HOW TO INTERPRET THE DATA:** If a particular issue (core issue or consequence) was not reported from a surveyed country, it means that all respondents from that country thought that issue either did not exist in their country or they did not know of the existence of that issue in their country at the time this survey was fielded (April 4th - April 22nd, 2020). (Answers checked: "No" or "I do not know").
**UNITED STATES & CANADA: DETAILED FINDINGS**

**Consequences** reported in this region:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Strike</th>
<th>Suspected deaths</th>
<th>Whistleblower: all reasons</th>
<th>Whistleblower: early warning</th>
<th>Whistleblower: equipment</th>
<th>Whistleblower: embezzlement</th>
<th>Whistleblower: other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>US</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**HOW TO INTERPRET THE DATA:** If a particular issue (core issue or consequence) was not reported from a surveyed country, it means that all respondents from that country thought that issue either did not exist in their country or they did not know of the existence of that issue in their country at the time this survey was fielded (April 4th - April 22nd, 2020). (Answers checked: "No" or "I do not know").
SOUTHERN ASIA: CORE ISSUES

- **PPE**
  - Stolen, bought but not delivered, purchased or sold at unusually high price

- **Black market**
  - Existence of

- **Faulty equipment**
  - Existence of

- **Cyber-attacks**
  - On healthcare systems

- **Embezzlement**
  - Of healthcare funds

- **Ventilators**
  - Stolen, bought but not delivered, purchased or sold at unusually high price

- **Bribes**
  - Demanded by medical personnel

Country was covered in this survey, issue reported

Country was covered in this survey, issue not reported

Country was not covered in this survey
SOUTHERN ASIA: CONSEQUENCES

- **Strike** (medical personnel refused to go to work due to core issues)
- **Deaths** (existence of, due to core issues)
- **Whistleblower** (whistleblower suffered retaliation)
- **Whistleblower: other** (whistleblower suffered retaliation for reporting something related to COVID-19, but unrelated to early warning, equipment, embezzlement)
- **Whistleblower: early warning** (whistleblower who reported virus early suffered retaliation)
- **Whistleblower: equipment** (whistleblower who reported missing PPE or ventilator suffered retaliation)
- **Whistleblower: embezzlement** (whistleblower who reported embezzlement suffered retaliation)

Country was covered in this survey, issue reported
Country was covered in this survey, issue not reported
Country was not covered in this survey
## Southern Asia: Detailed Findings

**Core issues** reported in this region:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>PPE</th>
<th>Black market</th>
<th>Faulty equipment</th>
<th>Cyber-attack</th>
<th>Embezzlement</th>
<th>Ventilators</th>
<th>Bribes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Afghanistan</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**How to interpret the Data:** If a particular issue (core issue or consequence) was not reported from a surveyed country, it means that all respondents from that country thought that issue either did not exist in their country or they did not know of the existence of that issue in their country at the time this survey was fielded (April 4th - April 22nd, 2020). (Answers checked: "No" or "I do not know").
# SOUTHERN ASIA: DETAILED FINDINGS

**Consequences** reported in this region:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Strike</th>
<th>Suspected deaths</th>
<th>Whistleblower: all reasons</th>
<th>Whistleblower: early warning</th>
<th>Whistleblower: equipment</th>
<th>Whistleblower: embezzlement</th>
<th>Whistleblower: other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Afghanistan</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**HOW TO INTERPRET THE DATA:** If a particular issue (core issue or consequence) was not reported from a surveyed country, it means that all respondents from that country thought that issue either did not exist in their country or they did not know of the existence of that issue in their country at the time this survey was fielded (April 4th - April 22nd, 2020). (Answers checked: "No" or "I do not know").
AFRICA: CORE ISSUES

- PPE: (stolen, bought but not delivered, purchased or sold at unusually high price)
- Black market: (existence of)
- Faulty equipment: (existence of)
- Cyber-attacks: (on healthcare systems)
- Embezzlement: (of healthcare funds)
- Ventilators: (stolen, bought but not delivered, purchased or sold at unusually high price)
- Bribes: (demanded by medical personnel)

Country was covered in this survey, issue reported
Country was covered in this survey, issue not reported
Country was not covered in this survey
AFRICA: CONSEQUENCES

- **Strike**: (medical personnel refused to go to work due to core issues)
- **Deaths**: (existence of, due to core issues)
- **Whistleblower**: (whistleblower suffered retaliation)
- **Whistleblower: other**: (whistleblower suffered retaliation for reporting something related to COVID-19, but unrelated to early warning, equipment, embezzlement)
- **Whistleblower: early warning**: (whistleblower who reported virus early suffered retaliation)
- **Whistleblower: equipment**: (whistleblower who reported missing PPE or ventilator suffered retaliation)
- **Whistleblower: embezzlement**: (whistleblower who reported embezzlement suffered retaliation)

Country was covered in this survey, issue reported
Country was covered in this survey, issue not reported
Country was not covered in this survey
# AFRICA: DETAILED FINDINGS

## Core issues reported in this region:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>PPE</th>
<th>Black market</th>
<th>Faulty equipment</th>
<th>Cyber-attack</th>
<th>Embezzlement</th>
<th>Ventilators</th>
<th>Bribes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Botswana</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghana</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kenya</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madagaskar</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mali</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Namibia</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Niger</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senegal</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S. Africa</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zambia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zimbabwe</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**HOW TO INTERPRET THE DATA:** If a particular issue (core issue or consequence) was not reported from a surveyed country, it means that all respondents from that country thought that issue either did not exist in their country or they did not know of the existence of that issue in their country at the time this survey was fielded (April 4th - April 22nd, 2020). (Answers checked: "No" or "I do not know").
AFRICA: DETAILED FINDINGS

**Consequences** reported in this region:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Strike</th>
<th>Suspected deaths</th>
<th>Whistleblower: all reasons</th>
<th>Whistleblower: early warning</th>
<th>Whistleblower: equipment</th>
<th>Whistleblower: embezzlement</th>
<th>Whistleblower: other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Botswana</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghana</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kenya</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberia</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madagascar</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mali</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Namibia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Niger</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senegal</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S. Africa</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zambia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zimbabwe</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**HOW TO INTERPRET THE DATA:** If a particular issue (core issue or consequence) was not reported from a surveyed country, it means that all respondents from that country thought that issue either did not exist in their country or they did not know of the existence of that issue in their country at the time this survey was fielded (April 4th - April 22nd, 2020). (Answers checked: "No" or "I do not know").
WESTERN EUROPE: CORE ISSUES

- **PPE** (stolen, bought but not delivered, purchased or sold at unusually high price)
- **Black market** (existence of)
- **Faulty equipment** (existence of)
- **Cyber-attacks** (on healthcare systems)
- **Embezzlement** (of healthcare funds)
- **Ventilators** (stolen, bought but not delivered, purchased or sold at unusually high price)
- **Bribes** (demanded by medical personnel)

Country was covered in this survey, issue reported
Country was covered in this survey, issue not reported
Country was not covered in this survey
WESTERN EUROPE: CONSEQUENCES

Strike
medical personnel refused to go to work due to core issues

Deaths
existance of, due to core issues

Whistleblower
(whistleblower suffered retaliation)

Whistleblower: early warning
(whistleblower who reported virus early suffered retaliation)

Whistleblower: equipment
(whistleblower who reported missing PPE or ventilator suffered retaliation)

Whistleblower: embezzlement
(whistleblower who reported embezzlement suffered retaliation)

Whistleblower: other
(whistleblower suffered retaliation for reporting something related to COVID-19, but unrelated to early warning, equipment, embezzlement)

Country was covered in this survey, issue reported

Country was covered in this survey, issue not reported

Country was not covered in this survey
### WESTERN EUROPE: DETAILED FINDINGS

**Core issues** reported in this region:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>PPE</th>
<th>Black market</th>
<th>Faulty equipment</th>
<th>Cyber-attack</th>
<th>Embezzlement</th>
<th>Ventilators</th>
<th>Bribes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Austria</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greece</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ireland</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**HOW TO INTERPRET THE DATA:** If a particular issue (core issue or consequence) was not reported from a surveyed country, it means that all respondents from that country thought that issue either did not exist in their country or they did not know of the existence of that issue in their country at the time this survey was fielded (April 4th - April 22nd, 2020). (Answers checked: "No" or "I do not know").
## Western Europe: Detailed Findings

### Consequences reported in this region:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Strike</th>
<th>Suspected deaths</th>
<th>Whistleblower: all reasons</th>
<th>Whistleblower: early warning</th>
<th>Whistleblower: equipment</th>
<th>Whistleblower: embezzlement</th>
<th>Whistleblower: other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Austria</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greece</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ireland</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spain</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**How to interpret the data:** If a particular issue (core issue or consequence) was not reported from a surveyed country, it means that all respondents from that country thought that issue either did not exist in their country or they did not know of the existence of that issue in their country at the time this survey was fielded (April 4th - April 22nd, 2020). (Answers checked: "No" or "I do not know").
MIDDLE EAST & NORTH AFRICA: CORE ISSUES

- **PPE**
  (stolen, bought but not delivered, purchased or sold at unusually high price)

- **Black market**
  (existence of)

- **Faulty equipment**
  (existence of)

- **Cyber-attacks**
  (on healthcare systems)

- **Embezzlement**
  (of healthcare funds)

- **Ventilators**
  (stolen, bought but not delivered, purchased or sold at unusually high price)

- **Bribes**
  (demanded by medical personnel)

Country was covered in this survey, issue reported
Country was covered in this survey, issue not reported
Country was not covered in this survey
MIDDLE EAST & NORTH AFRICA: CONSEQUENCES

**Whistleblower**
- **Suffered retaliation:**
  - Reporting something related to COVID-19, but unrelated to early warning, equipment, and embezzlement.
  - Reporting virus early suffered retaliation.
  - Reporting missing PPE or ventilator suffered retaliation.
  - Reporting embezzlement suffered retaliation.

**Country**
- **Covered in this survey, issue reported**
- **Covered in this survey, issue not reported**
- **Not covered in this survey**

- **Strike** (medical personnel refused to go to work due to core issues)
- **Deaths** (existence of, due to core issues)
- **Whistleblower** (whistleblower suffered retaliation)
- **Whistleblower: other** (whistleblower suffered retaliation for reporting something related to COVID-19, but unrelated to early warning, equipment, and embezzlement)
## MIDDLE EAST & NORTH AFRICA: DETAILED FINDINGS

**Core issues** reported in this region:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>PPE</th>
<th>Black market</th>
<th>Faulty equipment</th>
<th>Cyber-attack</th>
<th>Embezzlement</th>
<th>Ventilators</th>
<th>Bribes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cyprus</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Egypt</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jordan</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kuwait</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saudi Arabia</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UAE</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**How to interpret the data:** If a particular issue (core issue or consequence) was not reported from a surveyed country, it means that all respondents from that country thought that issue either did not exist in their country or they did not know of the existence of that issue in their country at the time this survey was fielded (April 4th - April 22nd, 2020). (Answers checked: "No" or "I do not know").
# MIDDLE EAST & NORTH AFRICA: DETAILED FINDINGS

**Consequences** reported in this region:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Strike</th>
<th>Suspected deaths</th>
<th>Whistleblower: all reasons</th>
<th>Whistleblower: early warning</th>
<th>Whistleblower: equipment</th>
<th>Whistleblower: embezzlement</th>
<th>Whistleblower: other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cyprus</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Egypt</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jordan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kuwait</td>
<td></td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saudi Arabia</td>
<td></td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UAE</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**HOW TO INTERPRET THE DATA:** If a particular issue (core issue or consequence) was not reported from a surveyed country, it means that all respondents from that country thought that issue either did not exist in their country or they did not know of the existence of that issue in their country at the time this survey was fielded (April 4th - April 22nd, 2020). (Answers checked: "No" or "I do not know").
ASIA-PACIFIC: CORE ISSUES

- **PPE**
  (stolen, bought but not delivered, purchased or sold at unusually high price)

- **Black market**
  (existence of)

- **Faulty equipment**
  (existence of)

- **Cyber-attacks**
  (on healthcare systems)

- **Embezzlement**
  (of healthcare funds)

- **Ventilators**
  (stolen, bought but not delivered, purchased or sold at unusually high price)

- **Bribes**
  (demanded by medical personnel)

- Country was covered in this survey, issue reported
- Country was covered in this survey, issue not reported
- Country was not covered in this survey
ASIA-PACIFIC: CONSEQUENCES

Strike
medical personnel refused to go to work due to core issues

Deaths
existence of, due to core issues

Whistleblower
whistleblower suffered retaliation

Whistleblower: early warning
whistleblower who reported virus early suffered retaliation

Whistleblower: equipment
whistleblower who reported missing PPE or ventilators suffered retaliation

Whistleblower: embezzlement
whistleblower who reported embezzlement suffered retaliation

Country was covered in this survey, issue reported

Country was covered in this survey, issue not reported

Country was not covered in this survey
## ASIA-PACIFIC: DETAILED FINDINGS

### Core issues reported in this region:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>PPE</th>
<th>Black market</th>
<th>Faulty equipment</th>
<th>Cyber-attack</th>
<th>Embezzlement</th>
<th>Ventilators</th>
<th>Bribes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Singapore</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**HOW TO INTERPRET THE DATA:** If a particular issue (core issue or consequence) was not reported from a surveyed country, it means that all respondents from that country thought that issue either did not exist in their country or they did not know of the existence of that issue in their country at the time this survey was fielded (April 4th - April 22nd, 2020). (Answers checked: "No" or "I do not know").
ASIA-PACIFIC: DETAILED FINDINGS

**Consequences** reported in this region:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Strike</th>
<th>Suspected deaths</th>
<th>Whistleblower: all reasons</th>
<th>Whistleblower: early warning</th>
<th>Whistleblower: equipment</th>
<th>Whistleblower: embezzlement</th>
<th>Whistleblower: other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Singapore</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**HOW TO INTERPRET THE DATA:** If a particular issue (core issue or consequence) was not reported from a surveyed country, it means that all respondents from that country thought that issue either did not exist in their country or they did not know of the existence of that issue in their country at the time this survey was fielded (April 4th - April 22nd, 2020). (Answers checked: "No" or "I do not know").
CE EUROPE & CENTRAL ASIA: CORE ISSUES

- **PPE**
  (stolen, bought but not delivered, purchased or sold at unusually high price)

- **Black market**
  (existence of)

- **Faulty equipment**
  (existence of)

- **Cyber-attacks**
  (on healthcare systems)

- **Embezzlement**
  (of healthcare funds)

- **Ventilators**
  (stolen, bought but not delivered, purchased or sold at unusually high price)

- **Bribes**
  (demanded by medical personnel)
CE EUROPE & CENTRAL ASIA: CONSEQUENCES

**Strike**
(medical personnel refused to go to work due to core issues)

**Deaths**
(existence of, due to core issues)

**Whistleblower**
(whistleblower suffered retaliation)

**Whistleblower: other**
(whistleblower suffered retaliation for reporting something related to COVID-19, but unrelated to early warning, equipment, embezzlement)

**Whistleblower: early warning**
(whistleblower who reported virus early suffered retaliation)

**Whistleblower: equipment**
(whistleblower who reported missing PPE or ventilator suffered retaliation)

**Whistleblower: embezzlement**
(whistleblower who reported embezzlement suffered retaliation)

Country was covered in this survey, issue reported

Country was covered in this survey, issue not reported

Country was not covered in this survey
# CE Europe & Central Asia: Detailed Findings

## Core Issues Reported in This Region:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>PPE</th>
<th>Black Market</th>
<th>Faulty Equipment</th>
<th>Cyber-Attack</th>
<th>Embezzlement</th>
<th>Ventilators</th>
<th>Bribes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bulgaria</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Croatia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estonia</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poland</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romania</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russia</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serbia</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**How to Interpret the Data:** If a particular issue (core issue or consequence) was not reported from a surveyed country, it means that all respondents from that country thought that issue either did not exist in their country or they did not know of the existence of that issue in their country at the time this survey was fielded (April 4th - April 22nd, 2020). (Answers checked: "No" or "I do not know").
## CE Europe & Central Asia: Detailed Findings

**Consequences** reported in this region:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Strike</th>
<th>Suspected deaths</th>
<th>Whistleblower: all reasons</th>
<th>Whistleblower: early warning</th>
<th>Whistleblower: equipment</th>
<th>Whistleblower: embezzlement</th>
<th>Whistleblower: other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bulgaria</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Croatia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estonia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poland</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romania</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russia</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serbia</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**How to Interpret the Data:** If a particular issue (core issue or consequence) was not reported from a surveyed country, it means that all respondents from that country thought that issue either did not exist in their country or they did not know of the existence of that issue in their country at the time this survey was fielded (April 4th - April 22nd, 2020). (Answers checked: "No" or "I do not know").
LATIN AMERICA & CARIBBEAN: CORE ISSUES

- **PPE**
  (stolen, bought but not delivered, purchased or sold at unusually high price)

- **Black market**
  (existence of)

- **Faulty equipment**
  (existence of)

- **Cyber-attacks**
  (on healthcare systems)

- **Embezzlement**
  (of healthcare funds during)

- **Ventilators**
  (stolen, bought but not delivered, purchased or sold at unusually high price)

- **Bribes**
  (demanded by medical personnel)

Country was covered in this survey, issue reported
Country was covered in this survey, issue not reported
Country was not covered in this survey
LATIN AMERICA & CARIBBEAN: CONSEQUENCES

Strike
(medical personnel refused to go to work due to core issues)

Deaths
(existance of, due to core issues)

Whistleblower
(whistleblower suffered retaliation)

Whistleblower: other
(whistleblower suffered retaliation for reporting something related to COVID-19, but unrelated to early warning, equipment, embezzlement)

Whistleblower: early warning
(whistleblower who reported virus early suffered retaliation)

Whistleblower: equipment
(whistleblower who reported missing PPE or ventilator suffered retaliation)

Whistleblower: embezzlement
(whistleblower who reported embezzlement suffered retaliation)
### Core issues reported in this region:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>PPE</th>
<th>Black market</th>
<th>Faulty equipment</th>
<th>Cyber-attack</th>
<th>Embezzlement</th>
<th>Ventilators</th>
<th>Bribes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Argentina</strong></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Brazil</strong></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chile</strong></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Colombia</strong></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Costa Rica</strong></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Honduras</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mexico</strong></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Panama</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peru</strong></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**HOW TO INTERPRET THE DATA:** If a particular issue (core issue or consequence) was not reported from a surveyed country, it means that all respondents from that country thought that issue either did not exist in their country or they did not know of the existence of that issue in their country at the time this survey was fielded (April 4th - April 22nd, 2020). (Answers checked: "No" or "I do not know").
CONSEQUENCES reported in this region:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Strike</th>
<th>Suspected deaths</th>
<th>Whistleblower: all reasons</th>
<th>Whistleblower: early warning</th>
<th>Whistleblower: equipment</th>
<th>Whistleblower: embezzlement</th>
<th>Whistleblower: other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Argentina</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brazil</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chile</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Costa Rica</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honduras</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mexico</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Panama</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peru</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

HOW TO INTERPRET THE DATA: If a particular issue (core issue or consequence) was not reported from a surveyed country, it means that all respondents from that country thought that issue either did not exist in their country or they did not know of the existence of that issue in their country at the time this survey was fielded (April 4th - April 22nd, 2020). (Answers checked: "No" or "I do not know").
With all the independent variables that come along with the COVID pandemic, I believe the most important factor will be educating the public and making people aware of the risk of fraud through these trying times.

Survey respondent, United Kingdom
Thank you for participating! You can receive the final results once the survey is closed and an analysis has been performed.

Q1: What country are you writing about?
Q2: What is the source of your information? You can check more than one option.
1: Media
2: Personal experience
3: Other
Q3: Are you an anti-fraud professional?
1: Yes
2: No
3: I do not know
Q4: Did any entity (government, corporation, hospital, etc.) suppress healthcare related whistleblowers in your country during the current pandemic?
1: Yes
2: No
3: I do not know
Q5: (IF Q4=Yes) Please describe why healthcare related whistleblowers were suppressed during the current pandemic in your country. You can check more than one option.
1: Whistleblower reporting the infection in its very early stage suffered repressions,
2: Whistleblower reporting missing equipment (personal protective equipment, ventilators, etc.) suffered repressions,
3: Whistleblower reporting financial embezzlement suffered repressions,
4: Whistleblower reporting something else but directly related to the Corona pandemic suffered repressions.
Q6: "Personal protective equipment" (PPE) includes facemasks, face shields or goggles, non-sterile gloves and an isolation gown. Was personal protective equipment stolen, bought or sold at unusually high prices or bought and never delivered?
1: Yes
2: No
3: I do not know
Q7: Ventilators include a machine and its supply of oxygen. Are you aware of ventilators being stolen, bought or sold at unusually high prices or bought and never delivered?
1: Yes
2: No
3: I do not know

Q8: Are you aware of a black market for test kits, personal protective equipments or ventilators in your country?
1: Yes
2: No
3: I do not know

Q9: Are you aware of faulty test kits, personal protective equipment and ventilators in your country?
1: Yes
2: No
3: I do not know

Q10: Are you aware of financial support from government and/or private entities from your country and/or abroad being embezzled by government entities, health care officials, hospital management, doctors or nurses?
1: Yes
2: No
3: I do not know

Q11: Did any of the cases above (whistleblower suppression; possible fraud involving test kits, personal protective equipment, ventilators; embezzlement of financial support) lead to suspected deaths?
1: Yes
2: No
3: I do not know

Q12: Did any of the cases above (whistleblower suppression; possible fraud involving test kits, personal protective equipment, ventilators; embezzlement of financial support) lead to physicians and/or nurses refusing to go to work in your country?
1: Yes
2: No
3: I do not know

Q13: Are you aware of doctors or nurses asking for bribes in order to test, admit, treat or care for patients with Covid-19 symptoms?
1: Yes
2: No
3: I do not know

Q14: Are you aware of cyber attacks on the healthcare system in your country during the current pandemic (CEO-fraud, DDOS, malware, etc.)?
1: Yes
2: No
3: I do not know
Q15: In conclusion: how important is the effect of the cases above (whistleblower suppression; possible fraud involving test kits, personal protective equipment, ventilators; embezzlement of financial support) on effectively fighting Corona in your country?
1: very important
2: important
3: somewhat important
4: unimportant
5: completely unimportant

Q16: Add here any other information you deem relevant related to fraud and corruption in healthcare during the pandemic, for example: What should be a priority of anti-fraud in your country?
CONTACT

For additional information contact:
Dr. Paul Milata, CFE
Managing Partner
NEMEXIS by Milata KG
Westhafenstr. 1
13353 Berlin
Germany

nemesis.de/en
Tel: +49(30)2336.1570
survey@nemesis.de

About us:
NEMEXIS is an anti-fraud consulting company based in Berlin, Germany. We are a service integrator collaborating with independent specialists worldwide in preventing, detecting and investigating fraud and corruption.

Imprint:
Pictures used:

Copyright © 2020 NEMEXIS by Milata KG. All rights reserved.